

The Visual Basis of Collective Identities

Soc. 573:01
Fall 2011
Th. 1:10-3:50

Professor Richard Williams
rwilliams@sociology.rutgers.edu
Seminar Room

Office Hours: M. 1:00-2:00; Th. 4:00-5:00 and by appointment:
111 Davison Hall

Our concern with collective identities is rooted in discussions of how we come to gain a sense of “self,” a sense of what is ‘normal’ in everyday life. More specifically, the normalizing function of a collective identity serves as a mechanism by which individuals, as identity members, learn how to “normally” engage in inward looking in order to ‘perform the self’ as well as how to observe/judge how others are performing. We will eventually be able to refer to that latter outward looking expectation as the ‘gaze’.

Our concern with visualizing (‘seeing’) is significant in that it calls attention to the role of visual representations in our ability to understand the world around us. The basic idea is that an interrogation of ‘seeing’ is one way of raising the question of how we make meaning in everyday life. In essence, such an interrogation is premised upon the claim that ‘seeing’ is never the ‘truth’ in any absolute sense. Rather, when we ‘see’ we are ‘reading’ the “seen” phenomenon through the framework of a learned ‘language’ (socially determined meanings attached to specific symbols). The ‘truthfulness’ of what we see is therefore related to the framework through which we “see”.

The relationship between the two that we will be working with is based on the premise of ‘collective identities’ as structuring mechanisms and ‘seeing’ as the historically based socio-cultural outcome of the structuring process. Despite the potential usefulness of such a top-down relationship we can also benefit from operating with the supposition that both “seeing” and ‘collective identities’ are ultimately constructed in similar ways. In essence, both are outcomes of social processes of ‘simplification’ and ‘selection’ resulting in the creation of “meaning” as well as the loss of memory about the meaning making process. Both are then ‘taken-for-granted’ and as such are treated by identity members as ‘natural’.

We will specifically be focusing on the ideas that (1) for social actors, the development (socialization; internalizing fixed meanings for symbols), enactment (performance in everyday life) and attempts at changing (social movements; passing; identity transformations) of collective identities are rooted in establishing a common ‘reading’ of symbols among group members about what is ‘normal’ for the self (self-perception) and for others (gaze) and (2) that the visual representations of those processes can be identified and fruitfully analyzed.

Underlying this course is the claim that despite the now commonly accepted notion of ‘social construction’ within the social sciences, we have yet to sufficiently interrogate (1) the social basis of “seeing” and (2) the importance of ‘seeing’ in structuring social behavior. Collective identities, as central to the sociological enterprise, are useful for this interrogation of the prevalence of ‘seeing’ in social behavior.

At the end of this course you will be able to engage in productive research based upon attention to the prevalence yet inconspicuousness of “seeing” as a social act in sociological research and in everyday life.

\$ Buy

***On Sakai**

****IRIS or JSTOR**

Introduction

Week I

1. Collective Identities demand that we “See”

*Appiah, K. 2005. Chapter 3, “The Demands of Identity.” in *The Ethics of Identity*

*Castells, M. 1997. “Communal Heavens: Identity and Meaning in the Network Society.” in his *The Power of Identity*.

*Hall, Stuart. 1996. “Introduction: Who Needs ‘Identity’?” In: Stuart Hall and Paul du Gay (eds.): *Questions of Cultural Identity*. 1–17.

2. Seeing as selection [Seeing as Value Laden]

“A new visual culture redefines both what it is to see, and what there is to see (Latour: 1990:10).”

*Bal, M. 1993. “His Master’s Eye.” In Levin, D. (ed.). 1993. *Modernity and the Hegemony of Vision*

*Barthes, R. 1977. “The Rhetoric of Image” in *Image, Music, Text*.

*Elkins, J. 1996. “Introduction,” and “Just Looking.” In his *The Object Stares Back*

**Gooding, D. 2006. “Visual cognition: where cognition and culture meet.” *Philosophy of Science*. 73, 688-698.

Part 1

Framing the Conversation

Collective Identity: Socialization, “Seeing,” Simplification of Cognition, Social Value and Meaning Fixing

Week II

Basic Socialization

\$Berger, P. and T. Luckmann. 1966. “Introduction and Part 1, “The Foundations of Knowledge in Everyday Life.” *The Social Construction of Reality*

**DiMaggio, P. 1997. “Culture and Cognition.” *Annual Review of Sociology*. 23:263-87

*Durkheim, E. “Social Facts”

\$Mead, G. “Part III: The Self” (pp. 135-200). *Mind, Self and Society*

**Swartz, D. 2002. “The Sociology of Habit: The Perspective of Pierre Bourdieu.” *Occupational Therapy Journal of Research*. 22, Supplement. 615-625

Week III

Theorizing Seeing/Looking

Bal, M. 2001. “Dispersing the Gaze: Focalization.” In *Looking in: the art of viewing*.

http://books.google.com/books?id=9nxCzIN67XcC&pg=PA41&lpg=PA41&dq=Bal+dispersing+the+gaze&source=bl&ots=GQIuU4OQsU&sig=lzXkHP6JnNBwcB67xqBbIu4Ws_E&hl=en&ei=IK5CTv-1Aafg0QHe-aWnCQ&sa=X&oi=book_result&ct=result&resnum=1&sqi=2&ved=0CBYQ6AEwAA#v=onepage&q=Bal%20dispersing%20the%20gaze&f=false

- *Foucault, M. 1980. "The Eye of Power." *In Power/Knowledge*
- *Goffman, E. "Introduction," "Performances," and "The Arts of Impression Management." *Presentation of Self in Everyday Life*
- **Latour, B. 1990. "Visualization and Cognition: thinking with eyes and hands." *Knowledge and Society*. 6 (1-40).
- *Levin, D. (ed.). 1993. "Introduction." *Modernity and the Hegemony of Vision*

Week IV

Collective Identity Gaze at the "Other" as a Collective Identity

- *Bhabha, H. 1983 "The Other Question." In Baker, F (ed.) *The politics of Theory*
- **Judge, A. 2010. "Scared of our Own Shadow? The Burka as a metaphorical mirror for Imperious culture." *Journal of Future Studies*. 15:2 (101-114).
- *Lutz, C. and J. Collins. 1993. "Becoming America's Lens on the World: National Geographic in the Twentieth Century," and "The Photograph as an Intersection of Gazes." In, *Reading National Geographic*
- *Said, E. 1978. *Orientalism*
- *Spivak, G. 1988. "Can the Subaltern Speak?" In *Marxism and the Interpretation of culture*. Nelson, C. and L. Grossberg (eds).

Part II

Collective identities visualized (Frames for Performance and Gazing)

The readings are not designed to be comprehensive of a particular collective identity. My concern in compiling them is with providing us with textual "data" for interrogation from a visual perspective.

Week V

Gender

- **Rupp, L. and V. Taylor. 1999. "Forging Feminist Identity in an International Movement: A Collective Identity Approach to Twentieth-Century Feminism." *Signs* 24:2
- *Butler, J. 1988. "Performative Acts and Gender Constitution." *Theatre Journal*, 40: 4. (Dec.), 519-531 (and ON LINE)
- **Butler, J. 1995. "Melancholy Gender—Refused Identification." *Psychoanalytic Dialogues*. 5(2): 165-180.
- **Crane, D. 2000. "Women's Clothing Behavior as Nonverbal Resistance." Men's Clothing and the Construction of Masculine Identities." "Fashion Images and the Struggle for Women's Identity." Chapters, 4, 6 and 7 of her. *Fashion and its Social Agenda: Class, Gender, and Identity in Clothing*
- *Negrin, L. 2008. Appearance and Identity," "Feminism and Fashion," "Cosmetics and the

Female Body,” and “The Postmodern Gender Carnival.” In her *Appearance and Identity: Fashioning the Body in Postmodernity*

*Solomon-Godeau, A. 1995. “Male Trouble.” In Berger, M. et al. *Constructing Masculinity*

Week VI

Sexuality

**Bersani, L. 1987. “Is the Rectum a Grave?” *October* 43 (Winter).

\$Foucault, M. 1990. “Parts, I and 2”. *The History of Sexuality* (I)

**Gamson, J. 1996. “The Organizational Shaping of Collective Identity: The Case of Lesbian and Gay Film Festivals in New York.” *Sociological Forum*, 11:2 (231-261).

*Kaminski, E. and V. Taylor. 2008. “We’re Not Just Lip-synching up Here: Music and collective Identity in Drag Performances.” In Reger, J. et al., (eds.) *Identity Work in Social Movements*

*Taylor, V., Whittier, N. E. 1992. Collective Identity in Social Movement Communities: Lesbian Feminist Mobilization. In: Morris A. D. and Mueller C. M. (eds.) *Frontiers in Social Movement Theory*.

*Ward, J. 2008. “Diversity Discourse and Multi-identity Work in Lesbian and Gay Organizations.” In Reger, J. et al., (eds.) *Identity Work in Social Movements*

Week VII

The Criminal

**Chellotis, L. 2010. “The Ambivalent Consequences of Visibility: Crime and Prisons in the Mass Media.” *Crime Media Culture*. 6:2 (169-84).

\$Finn, J. 2009. *Capturing the Criminal Image: From Mug Shot to Surveillance Society*

**Goldsmith, A. “Policing’s New Visibility.” *British Journal of Criminology*. 50: 5 (914-34)

<http://prisonerpics.blogspot.com/2007/12/thomas-nevins-hand-coloured-convict.html>

*Sekula, A. 1989. “The Body and the Archive.” In *The Contest of Meaning*. Bolton, R. (ed.)

Week VIII

Disability

**McRuer, R. 2005. “Crip Eye for the Normate Guy: Queer Theory and the Disciplining of Disability Studies.” *Modern Language Association*. 120:2 (586-92)

**Bumiller, K. 2008. “Quirky Citizens: Autism, Gender, and Reimagining Disability.” *Signs* 33:4 (967-991).

Connolly, K. “The Rolling Exhibition”. <http://therollingexhibition.com/>

*Garland-Thompson, R. 2002. “The Politics of Staring: Visual Rhetorics of Disability in Popular Photography.” *Disability Studies: Enabling the Humanities*

**Garland-Thompson, R. 2005. “Feminist Disability Studies.” *Signs*. 30:2 (1557-1587).

Week IX

Illness/Health

**Bell, S. 2011. “Claiming justice: Knowing mental illness in the public art of Anna Schuleit's 'Habeas Corpus' and 'Bloom'.” *Health (London)* 15: 313.

- **Conrad, P. 2005. "The Shifting Engines of Medicalization." *Journal of Health and Social Behavior*. 56 (March): 3-14
- *Diedrich, L. 2007. "Patients and Biopower: Ideas, Experience, and Affect," and "Politicizing Patienthood: Ideas, Experience, and Affect." In *Treatments: Language, Politics, and the Culture of Illness*
- *Horowitz, A. 2002. *Creating Mental Illness* [Selected chapters]
- *Hustvedt, Asti. 2011. *Medical Muses: Hysteria in Nineteenth-Century Paris* [Selected chapters]
- *James, A. and Hockey, J. 2007. *Embodying Health Identities* [Selected chapters]

Week X

Trauma based Collective Identity

- *Alexander, J. "Toward a Theory of Cultural Trauma." In Alexander, J. (et al., eds.) 2004. *Cultural Trauma and Collective Identity*
- **Callahan, William A. 2007. "Trauma and Community: The Visual Politics of Chinese Nationalism and Sino-Japanese Relations." *Theory & Event* (10:4)
- Canada - [Hidden from History - Voices of the Candian Holocaust](#)
Listen to online mp3 audio files of the voices of residential school survivors and their accounts of murder, electro-shock experiments, involuntary sterilizations and other atrocities.
- *Eyerman, R. 2004. "Cultural Trauma: Slavery and the Formation of African American Identity." In Alexander, J. (et al., eds.) 2004. *Cultural Trauma and Collective Identity*
- *Hirsh, M. 2000. "Surviving Images: Holocaust Photographs and the Work of Postmemory." Zeliger, B. (ed.) *Visual Culture and the Holocaust*.
- Reyhner, J. and J. Eder 2006. *American Indian Education: A History*. [Selected Chapters]
- *Smelser, N. 2004. "Epilogue: September 11, 2001, as Cultural Trauma." In Alexander, J. (et al., eds.) 2004. *Cultural Trauma and Collective Identity*
- *Sztompka, P. 2004. "The Trauma of Social Change: A Case of Postcommunist Societies." In Alexander, J. (et al., eds.) 2004. *Cultural Trauma and Collective Identity*

Week XI

National Identity

- *Adams, L. "What is Culture? Schemas and Spectacles in Uzbekistan"
scholarworks.iu.edu/journals/index.php/aeer/article/viewFile/674/767
- \$Anderson, B. 1983. *Imagined Communities*.
- Cerulo, K. 1996. *Identity Designs: The Sights and Sounds of a Nation* [Selected Chapters]
- *Laitin, D. 1998. "Part Four: Nationalism and Identity Shift." In *Identity Formation: The Russian Speaking Populations in the Near Abroad*.
- *Lutz, C. and J. Collins. 1993. "Comfortable Strangers: The Making of National Identity in Popular Photography." In, *Reading National Geographic*
- *Weber, M. 1977. "The Nation." In *Economy and Society*, Vol. 1.
- Zerabuel, Y. 1994. *Recovered Roots: Collective Memory and the Making of Israeli National Tradition* [Selected Chapters]

Week XII

Class

- *Crane, D. 2000. "Working-Class Clothing and the Experience of Social Class in the 19th Century." "Fashion Worlds and Global Markets: From Class to Consumer Fashion." In her *Fashion and its Social Agenda: Class, Gender, and Identity in Clothing*
- *Eineigel, S. 2003. "Visualizing the Self: Modernity, Identity, and the *Gente Decente* in Porfirian Mexico.
- **Ignatow, G. 2004. "Speaking Together, Thinking Together? Exploring Metaphor and Cognition in a Shipyard Union Dispute." *Sociological Forum*. (19:3).
- **Ross, S. "The Visual Politics of Class: Silent Film and the Public Sphere." 2003. *Film International* (1:2) 'Class Visions: a special issue'
- Salgado, S. *Workers*.
<http://www.photoeye.com/bookstore/citation.cfm?catalog=AP291&i=&i2=&CFID=20892542&CFTOKEN=36371328> (Illustration of the selling of 'Workers')
<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5X76jjeUgTQ&feature=related> (Documentary Part 1)
<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QOUvjLDBym8&feature=related> (Documentary Part 2)
<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=u0VqE8VH2RQ&feature=related> (Documentary Part 3)

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MCtCN1NnmXI&feature=related> (Documentary Part 4)
http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4KwZ_GI9-Es&feature=related (Documentary Part 5)
<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=kQKt9zEqMZk&feature=related> (Documentary Part 6)
Salgado display <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VC0hw0M6oQw>
- *Walkowitz, D. 1999. "The Making of a Feminine Professional Identity," and "The Evisceration of the Professional Worker Identity." in *Working with Class: Social Workers and the Politics of Middle-Class Identity*

Week XIII

Race/Ethnicity

- **Burton, D and M. Klemm. 2011. "Whiteness, ethnic minorities and advertising in travel brochures." *The Service Industries Journal*. (31:5).
- *Chinn, S. 2000. "Fixing Identity: Reading Skin, Seeing Race." in *Technology and the Logic of American Racism: A Cultural History of the Body as Evidence*
- **Einwohner, R. 2006. "Identity Work and Collective Action in a Repressive Context: Jewish Resistance on the 'Aryan Side' of the Warsaw Ghetto." *Social Problems*. 53:1 (38-56).
- *Laitin, D. D. 1998. "Why the Peripheral Peoples Did Not Become Russians," and "Identity and Ethnic Violence." In, *Identity in Formation: The Russian-Speaking Populations in the Near Abroad*.
- *Massey, D. and M. Sanchez. 2010. "Constructing Immigrant Identity," and "Visualizing Identity." *Brokered Boundaries: Creating Immigrant Identity in Anti-Immigrant Times*.
- *Trevor-Roper, H. 1983. "The Invention of Tradition: The Highland Tradition of Scotland". In Hobsbawm E. and Ranger T. (eds.) *The Invention of Tradition*

Part III Concluding Frame breaking: Schema Failure

Week XIV

Visual aspects of Social Change: Collective identities in transition

Berger, M. 2011. *Seeing through Race: A Reinterpretation of Civil Rights Photographs*
[Selected Chapters]

*Cronin, J. 2000. "Changing Perspectives: Photography and First Nations Identity" *PhD*.
Queen's University, Kingston, Ontario, Canada

**Foldy, E., L. Goldman and S. Ospina. 2008. "Sensegiving and the role of cognitive shifts in
the work of leadership." *The Leadership Quarterly*. 19 (514-529).

**Holland, D. et al. 2008. "Social Movements and Collective Identity." *Anthropological
Quarterly*. 81:1 (Winter: 95-126).

**Polletta, F. J. Jasper. 2001. Collective Identity and Social Movements. *Annual
Review of Sociology* 27:283-305.

*Rorty, R. 1999 [1989]. "Part I: Contingency." In his *Contingency, Irony and Solidarity*

*Roth, B. 2008. "The Reconstruction of Collective Identity in the Emergence of U.S. White
Women's Liberation." In Reger, J. et al., (eds.) *Identity Work in Social Movements*

Grading

Class participation [10% of grade]

Weekly responses to readings posted to Sakai [10% of grade]

Four short essays (approx. 4 pages) [60% of grade]

Week 3

Week 7

Week 10

Week 14

Last longer essay (10-15 pages) [20% of grade] Dec. 19th

Using data from a visual archive with attention to how related social movement is an attempt at
visually changing the social value of identity elements. To what extent is that attempt being
made consciously? To what extent do social movement leaders demonstrate awareness of the
visual significance (PERFORMANCE, self-perception; how should I act, look; "make-up") of
collective identity cohesion? How do social movements provide collective identity members
with ways of perceiving (GAZE at) non-identity members?

Links to some major visual archives are in the Resource/Archives section of the course site on
SAKAI.

Readings to Buy

Anderson, B. 1983. *Imagined Communities*.

Berger, P. and T. Luckmann. 1966. *The Social Construction of Reality*

Finn, J. 2009. *Capturing the Criminal Image: From Mug Shot to Surveillance Society*

Foucault, M. 1990. *The History of Sexuality* (I)

Mead, G. "Part III: The Self" (pp. 135-200). *Mind, Self and Society*

Said, E. 1978. *Orientalism*

